

CARIANS IN SARDIS*

TEN years ago an article in these pages stressed the importance of detailed analysis of the traditions involving the Carians, and archaeological evidence was used to check the assertions of the literary record.¹ In that instance the extremest version of the tradition in question was shown to be largely inexact, while the less extreme preserved the probable truth of the Carians' habitual use of certain military devices. That the ghost of pan-Carianism should be well and truly laid is all to the good; yet I hope to show here that the literary record, such as it is, of the presence of Carians in the Lydian capital is reasonably substantiated by the archaeological and epigraphic material.

Herodotus' Carian source² pointed to an old relationship between the Lydians and Carians, symbolised by the temple of Carian Zeus at Mylasa and by the kinship of the eponymous heroes Car and Lydus. According to this source linguistic affinities existed between Lydians and Carians. In Strabo's time³ Lydians and Carians together inhabited the plain of the Maeander, though the Carians evidently exercised sole possession of the land to the south of the river. In the late seventh and sixth centuries, however, Lydians and Carians lived cheek by jowl in Aphrodisias, and there is good archaeological and epigraphic evidence for a Lydian community in the city.⁴ Whether this means that we must attempt to redraw the boundary between Lydian- and Carian-speakers (if such a boundary is logically acceptable) or whether the Lydians represented a trading community in a foreign (if friendly) city, remains to be seen. There is some evidence to suggest that Carians were present in archaic Smyrna,⁵ and epigraphic documentation for their presence, if not in Ephesos, at any rate at Belevi.⁶ They had a natural interest in their northern neighbours.

According to Plutarch,⁷ the accession of the Mermnads to the throne of Sardis was assisted by Arselis of Mylasa, a Carian ally of Gyges. Not only, according to this version of the disposal of Kandaules, did Arselis kill the last Heraklid king in Sardis, but he also took away the ritual axe, sometime property of Hippolyte and Omphale and part of the religious paraphernalia of the Lydian kings. In Caria he built a statue to Zeus which he equipped with the axe and called Labrandeus. If Plutarch's purpose may have been primarily etymological, to elucidate the use of a Lydian word in important Carian contexts,⁸ his (probably) Hellenistic source has nevertheless given us an account of Carian intervention in a civil war (or *coup d'état*) in seventh-century Sardis. This story may be accounted for by the imagination or gullibility of Alexandrian scholars, but it is not inherently unlikely, and I am inclined to believe that the story was current and accepted in responsible Hellenistic circles. Plutarch's source has also given us a record of religious contiguity

* I should like to record my thanks to the Horace H. Rackham School of Graduate Studies of The University of Michigan which generously enabled me to visit Turkey in the summer of 1972. I am very grateful to Professor G. M. A. Hanfmann, Field Director of the Harvard-Cornell excavations at Sardis, for permission to use material from the new excavations in this article; and I am also most grateful to Professor C. H. Greenwalt of the University of California at Berkeley for his courteous assistance at Sardis and for the photograph.

The following abbreviations are used:

Gusmani = R. Gusmani, *Lydisches Wörterbuch* (Heidelberg 1964).

Laumonier = A. Laumonier, *Les Cultes indigènes de Carie* (Paris 1958).

RHA = Revue hittite et asianique.

RhM = Rheinisches Museum für Philologie.

BASOR = Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research.

¹ A. M. Snodgrass, *JHS* lxxxiv (1964) 107-18.

² Hdt. i 171.

³ Strabo 649; 651.

⁴ O. Carruba, *JHS* xc (1970) 195.

⁵ L. H. Jeffery, *BSA* lix (1964) 42-3, 44, 47.

⁶ W. Dressler, *ÖJh* xlvi (1966-7) 73-6.

⁷ Plutarch, *Quaestiones Graecae* 45.

⁸ Gusmani, 275.

between Caria and Lydia, perhaps epitomised metaphorically by the association of a Lydian word with a Carian god and a Carian place name.⁹

Herodotos says that Gyges attacked the Greek cities on the coast, Miletus, Smyrna and Colophon, and that his son Ardys followed his example, launching campaigns against Priene and Miletus.¹⁰ It is possible that these campaigns may have been instigated, to some degree at any rate, by a Carian alliance or pro-Carian thinking, though economic and trade rivalries doubtless played a major role. Alyattes took a Carian wife who became by him the mother of Croesus,¹¹ and Nicolaus of Damascus, probably drawing on Xanthus the Lydian,¹² records that when Croesus was governor of Adramyteion and the plain of Thebe, Alyattes campaigned against Caria.¹³ That Alyattes' Carian wife, or the Carians in Sardis, were influential with the king is suggested by the fact that in the struggle for the succession Alyattes intervened on behalf of Croesus. The contender for the throne, Pantaleon, was a younger son of Alyattes by a Greek woman,¹⁴ and though some Lydians supported him (to their cost)¹⁵ it is possible that most Lydians favoured Alyattes' son by a Carian, and their old relationship with Caria.

That many languages were spoken in Sardis is now shown beyond doubt by the recovery of the large epichoric inscription in the recent excavations.¹⁶ This inscription is deeply cut in stone with careful characters evidently intended to be widely read. Many of the characters are recognisably Lydian, but several are not, and some are thought to be Carian, or para-Carian.¹⁷ Though undeciphered, this inscription speaks eloquently of a multi-lingual society in archaic Sardis, and of the presence of citizens who could read Carian characters as well as Lydian. The presence of Carian-speakers in Sardis is attested more fully by the recovery of Carian graffiti from archaic levels in the city.¹⁸ While the Carian language itself is still largely unknown,¹⁹ these graffiti are important for their contribution to our knowledge of the development of Carian writing, as well as for what they tell us of the presence of Carians (or Carian-speakers) in Sardis.

Most of these graffiti were found in a restricted area of little more than five square metres in the commercial-industrial sector (market place) of the city. They came to light in two groups according to stratification, one group of graffiti in a stratum dated to *c.* 650–*c.* 625 B.C., and the other group in a stratum dated to the period *c.* 625–*c.* 550 B.C. Extraordinary ceramic assemblages were found lying nearby in the same strata in the same trench. These assemblages, of which no less than twenty-seven were retrieved, were concentrated in an area of little more than twelve square metres, adjacent to and overlapping the area where the Carian graffiti were found. These pot clusters consist of four vessels of different shapes,

⁹ On this passage see W. R. Halliday, *The Greek Questions of Plutarch* (Oxford 1928) 185–9.

¹⁰ Hdt. i 14–15.

¹¹ Hdt. i 92.

¹² On Xanthus see L. Pearson, *Early Ionian Historians* (Oxford 1939) and *cf.* H. Herter, *PW* s.v. 'Xanthos' 2: 18 (1968) 1354–74; H. Herter, *RhM* cviii (1965) 187–212.

¹³ F. Jacoby, *FGrHist* 90 F 65.

¹⁴ Hdt. i 92.

¹⁵ Plutarch, *De Herodoti Malignitate* 18 (858E); Nicolaus of Damascus, *FGrHist* 90 F 65.

¹⁶ G. M. A. Hanfmann, *BASOR* clxxiv (1964) 50–1; G. M. A. Hanfmann, *BASOR* cxci (1968) 16.

¹⁷ R. Gusmani, *Indogermanische Forschung* lxix (1964) 134–8; G. Neumann, *Kadmos* iv (1965) 159–64; G. Neumann, *Kadmos* vii (1968) 94–5.

¹⁸ G. M. A. Hanfmann and O. Masson, *Kadmos* vi (1967) 123–34. Beyond the graffiti found in the

market-place and published by Hanfmann and Masson, three other fragmentary Carian inscriptions have been found at Sardis, two of which again were discovered in the market-place.

¹⁹ On Carian see V. V. Ševoroškin, *RHA* lxxiv (1964) 1–55; V. V. Ševoroškin, *Issledovanija po dešifrovke karijskix nadpisej* (Moscow 1965); P. Meriggi, *Kadmos* v (1966) 61–102; J. V. Otkupščikov, *Karijskie nadpisi Afriki* (Leningrad 1966); G. M. A. Hanfmann and J. C. Waldbaum, *AJA* lxxii (1968) 54 n. 25; V. V. Ševoroškin, *Kadmos* vii (1968) 150–73. On Carian inscriptions in Caria see L. Robert, *Hellenica* viii (1950) 5–21; in Egypt, see J. Friedrich, *Kleinasiatische Sprachdenkmäler* (Berlin 1932) 90–107. Subsequent publications of Carian inscriptions from Egypt are listed in L. Deroy, *Ant. class.* xxiv (1955) 305–6. *Cf.* also O. Masson, *RHA* lv (1953) 32–8; L. H. Jeffery, *The Local Scripts of archaic Greece* (Oxford 1961) 314.

a skyphos, a round-mouthed jug with vertical handle, a trefoil oinochoe and a plate. Differences of shape exist in pots of the same type, yet since these differences occur in pots belonging to groups found at the same level and very close to one another, it is unlikely that these differences necessarily carry chronological significance. Within eleven of the round-mouthed jars were found the skeletons of puppies.²⁰ Each cluster of pots was often accompanied by an iron knife²¹ (PLATE XII). These concentrations of identical pottery groups and their contents evidently suggest a repeated and ritual event. It is certainly tempting to associate them with the Carian graffiti and to suggest that together they provide evidence for the similarity of Lydian and Carian religious practices. Hanfmann has already suggested that we may consider the possibility of religious structures existing in the Lydian market place.²²

Hipponax, who though a Greek used many Lydian words,²³ invokes 'Hermes, the Dog-Throttler, known in Maeonian as Kandaulas'.²⁴ It is interesting to note that the Ionic form of Kandaulas, Kandaules, is the name of the last Heraklid king of Sardis, and I have suggested elsewhere that the Heraklids in Sardis may reasonably be equated with the Maeonians, a suggestion which Zgusta has tentatively endorsed.²⁵ In Kandaules' name I see some clear suggestion of the divinity of the pre-Mermnad kings of Lydia. More important here is the correlation between the archaeological record and 'Hermes, the Dog-Throttler'. The archaeology gives the physical evidence of ritual sacrifices or meals,²⁶ involving dogs, dedicated to a god worshipped in Sardis. It seems logical to identify this deity as Hipponax' Hermes, whose Maeonian name was Kandaulas, and equally logical that the archaeological evidence should be concentrated in the market place, the meeting ground of the merchants (and probably thieves also) whose deity Hermes was.

Hipponax' epithet for Hermes is known nowhere else in Greek, nor is any ritual involving the sacrifice of dogs known in his cult. Masson has shown that Kandaules was known also as Herakles, and he is inclined to think that he was related to an Indo-European war god, who was worshipped as a wolf, and to whom dogs were sacrificed.²⁷ Evidently, for the Greek mind, two aspects of Kandaulas were reflected by Hermes and Herakles. Until the Carian language is fully deciphered, little can be known directly of early Carian cults,²⁸ but the proximity of the graffiti in Sardis to the pottery clusters suggests that the power of the deity to whom these clusters and their contents were dedicated was recognised by Carians in Sardis, and hence probably in Caria also.

Animal sacrifice in classical antiquity is well attested. An early Roman tradition, for example, involved the sacrifice of a pig during the ceremonies concluding a treaty between Rome and the Albans.²⁹ At the Roman Lupercalia a dog was sacrificed,³⁰ and the same practice is found in Greece. Puppies were sacrificed to Enyalios in Sparta, and a similar ritual was held in Colophon.³¹ Dogs were important offerings to Ares in Macedonia, as they were also to Hephaisstos and Asklepios, and to Hekate at Samothrace. In Boeotia a dog was involved in a significant act of purification, the *periskyllakismos*,³² while in Attica a

²⁰ Twenty-six such pot clusters with small animal skeletons have been found in Sardis; of these, twenty-three, including the eleven under discussion, come from the market place.

²¹ G. M. A. Hanfmann, *BASOR* clxvi (1962) 8-9.

²² G. M. A. Hanfmann and O. Masson, *op. cit.* note 18, 125.

²³ Gusmani, 273, 274, 276.

²⁴ Whence Tzetzes, *Chiliades* 5.482, and Hesychius. O. Masson, *Les Fragments du poète Hipponax* (Paris 1962) F 3, 103-6; A. Farina, *Ipponatte* (Naples 1963) F 35, 107-8. For an Anatolian origin for Hermes see L. Deroy, *Athenaeum* xxx (1952) 59-84.

²⁵ J. G. Pedley, *Sardis in the Age of Croesus* (Norman 1968) 27; rev. L. Zgusta, *Archiv Orientalni* xxxviii (1970) 72-3.

²⁶ On the Lydian dish, *kandaulos*, see Athenaeus, *Deip.* iv 132 f., iv 172b, xii 516d. And cf. Gusmani, 274.

²⁷ Hesychius s.v. 'Kandaulas'. Cf. O. Masson, *op. cit.* note 24, 105-6.

²⁸ Though cf. Laumonier *passim*.

²⁹ Livy i 24.

³⁰ Plutarch, *Quaestiones Romanae* 290D.

³¹ Paus. iii 14.9.

³² Laumonier 419.

puppy was occasionally offered to Demeter and Kore.³³ Finally, as Laumonier points out, the dog was the sacrificial animal *par excellence*, the *καρικὸν θῦμα*, among the Carians.³⁴ In Caria, the dog was sacrificed to Ares, and, as at Colophon, to Hekate.³⁵

The ancient oriental texts tell us of a parallel practice existing in the East. Among the Mari documents are several references to covenants, and at one of these a puppy is sacrificed.³⁶ In the Old Testament there is mention of the sacrifice of dogs,³⁷ and the similarity to the reference in Hipponax is closer. The text uses a rare word found only in cultic contexts a total of six times, the traditional interpretation of which is 'to break the neck'. The verb is probably a denominative from the ordinary word for 'neck', and could mean also 'to strangle' or even 'to cut the throat'.³⁸ The similarity to Hipponax' mention of Hermes the Dog-Throttler is striking, as is the poetic parallelism of the two passages. The passage in Isaiah dates from the Persian period, and evidently refers to some ritual custom.

The sacrifice of dogs or puppies was, then, a recognised and continuing practice in the Near East, while in Greece and Rome a similar ritual was performed. In Caria, the ritual enjoyed a special significance and popularity. That this practice may have found its way into Asia Minor from Mesopotamia is possible, and its appearance at Sardis at the date for which we have archaeological evidence is comprehensible in view of the connection between the Lydian and Assyrian kings in the seventh century,³⁹ and the appearance of a Jewish community in Sardis in the middle of the sixth.⁴⁰ Yet, on balance, the literary notices of the presence of Carians in the city, together with the epigraphic evidence and the popularity of the ritual in Caria itself,⁴¹ suggest that this ceremony came to Sardis from Caria or was part of a common religious inheritance.⁴²

Whether the Carians, then, articulated in Sardis a religious substratum common throughout early Anatolia, and at the same time expressed the high antiquity of their relationship with Lydia echoes of which are heard in the relationship of the heroes Lydus and Car, or not, it seems evident that Carians were religiously active in the Lydian capital. That they were linguistically influential is shown by the epigraphic evidence from the city, and their political power is demonstrated by the incidents involving Arselis of Mylasa and the accession of Croesus.

JOHN GRIFFITHS PEDLEY

*The University of Michigan and The Institute of
Classical Studies, University of London*

³³ F. Chamoux, *La Civilisation Grecque à l'époque Archaique et Classique* (Paris 1965) 214 pl. 94.

³⁴ Pseudo-Plutarch, *De Proverbiis Alexandrinorum* 73. Laumonier 420, 669.

³⁵ Laumonier 420.

³⁶ G. E. Mendenhall, *BASOR* cxxxiii (1954) 26-30.

³⁷ Isaiah 66.3.

³⁸ The customary interpretation rests on nothing

but late tradition. In these comments I am much indebted to Professor George Mendenhall.

³⁹ J. G. Pedley, *Ancient Literary Sources on Sardis* (Cambridge, Mass. 1972) 292-5.

⁴⁰ A. T. Kraabel, *GRBS* x (1969) 81, n. 2.

⁴¹ Admittedly at an uncertain date, and not to Hermes.

⁴² Laumonier 725.



Skyphos P 64. 383: 6503
Plate P 64. 384: 6504

Pot Cluster with Knife. P 64. 381: 6501
Oinochoe P 64. 382: 6502

CARIANS IN SARDIS